

Edunity

Volume 3 Number 4, April, 2024 p- ISSN 2963-3648- e-ISSN 2964-8653



ROLE MODEL OF THE EDUCATION COUNCIL ON THE PERFORMANCE OF MADRASAH PRINCIPALS AND MADRASAH TEACHERS (PRIVATE) IN BEKASI DISTRICT

Lutfan Son'any¹, Irwan Prayitno², Iswan³

Universitas Muhammadiyah, Jakarta, Indonesia email: s.lutfan@yahoo.com¹, irwan.prayitno@umj.ac.id², iswanfipumj@gmail.com³

ABSTRACT

Research on the Role Model of the Education Council on the Performance of Madrasah Principals and Madrasah Teachers, conducted by sampling 9 madrasahs in Bekasi District, utilizes both quantitative (questionnaires) and qualitative (interviews, observations, and document analysis) methods. The study addresses the lack of attention to education in madrasahs from local governments and relevant educational institutions. This lack of attention leads to various issues regarding madrasah services, facilities, curriculum, performance, low student enrollment, and madrasah output. These issues need to be addressed seriously through oversight from institutions overseeing education, including the Education Council. This institution plays a quantitative control role and three qualitative roles: Advice, Support, and Mediator. Implementing teaching approaches tailored to the characteristics of madrasah principals and teachers is essential. The research adopts a descriptive approach with qualitative methods. Data collection procedures include observation, interviews, and documentation. Data analysis is conducted interactively and continuously. The findings indicate that the role of the Education Council in improving education quality in Bekasi District still has many shortcomings due to the lack of implementation of the institution's work programs. In conclusion, the role of the Education Council in enhancing education quality in Bekasi District is not optimally executed. The research benefits from understanding and exploring the extent to which the model of the Education Council's role affects the quality of education services, especially for Islamic educational institutions such as madrasahs at the elementary, junior high, and high school levels.

Keywords: Controlling; Madrasah Principal Performance; Support; Consideration; Mediator; Education Council; Madrasah

Introduction

The Education Council is an institution established based on the mandate of the law stipulated in the National Education System Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 Year 2003 (Hartono, 2015). Article 56, Paragraphs 1 and 2 state that in paragraph (1), The community plays a role in improving the quality of education services, including planning, supervision, and evaluation of educational programs through the Education Council and School/Madrasah Committees(Sahara Siregar, 2020). Paragraph (2) reads, The Education

Council as an independent institution is formed and plays a role in improving the quality of education services by providing considerations, directions, and support in terms of human resources, facilities, infrastructure, and education supervision at the national, provincial, and district/city levels without hierarchical relationships.

Referring to the grand theory used in this research related to the role of the Education Council, it can be rewritten to ensure the relationship and correlation between theories proposed by experts with the research results, thus clearly showing its role and indicators, both quantitative and qualitative variables. The quantitative variable is a control role and the qualitative variable investigated in this study by its roles are the supporting role, consideration role, and mediation role. The complete qualitative roles can be seen in the table below:

> Table 1 The complete qualitative roles

Role of The	Educational Management	Performance Indicators	
Education Council	Management Functions	r eriormance indicators	
		Controlling the decision-making process	
		in the education department	
		environment.	
		Controlling the quality of policies in the	
		education department environment.	
	Controlling	Controlling the education planning	
	Educational Planning	process in the education department environment.	
		Controlling the quality of education	
		planning in the education department	
		environment	
		Controlling the quality of education	
		programs	
	_	Controlling the implementation of	
		educational organization	
		Controlling program scheduling	
	Monitoring Programs	Controlling allocation of program	
Controlling Agency		implementation funds	
		Controlling implementation program	
		resources	
		Controlling school and community	
		participation in programs	
	Monitoring	Monitoring education participation rates	
	Educational Outputs	Monitoring repetition rates	
		Monitoring retention rates	
		Monitoring transition rates	
	36. 11. 1	Monitoring National Exam results	
	Monitoring	Monitoring regional economic growth	
	Educational Outcomes	Monitoring local employment	

Role of The Education Council	Educational Management Functions	Performance Indicators
		Monitoring local social and cultural conditions
		Monitoring teachers' participation in using technology-based teaching methods
		Monitoring institutional cooperation relationships

(Source:(Jamaludin, 2018)).

Table 2 Indicator of the Qualitative Role of the Education Council

No	Qualitative Role	Indicators	
	Support Agency	Monitoring the educational workforce conditions in schools	
		Mobilizing non-teaching educational personnel to address shortcomings	
		Coordinating support for facilities and infrastructure from the community	
		Monitoring the education budget conditions in schools	
	Advice Agency	Identifying community aspirations in the field of education	
		Providing recommendations on decisions to the	
		Department of Education	
		Providing considerations regarding local content to the	
		Department of Education	
		Providing considerations on teacher and principal rotation	
	Mediator Agency	Acting as a liaison between the Department of Education and the Regional Representative Council (DPRD)	
		Acting as a liaison between the Department of	
		Education and schools	
		Communicating public complaints and grievances regarding education-related agencies	
		Coordinating community assistance	

Source: (Arisujati, n.d.) & Dasim Budimansyah (Directorate General of Primary and Secondary Education, Ministry of Education)

Based on the aforementioned law, the community is required to actively participate in the field of education, one of which is the establishment of an Education Council institution aimed at improving the quality of educational services. Through this Education Council, the community can directly involve themselves as administrators or indirectly provide inputs to this institution regarding educational facilities, general educational services, and the learning process in Islamic educational institutions such as Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, Madrasah Tsanawiyah, and Madrasah Aliyah, so that the implementation of educational activities in these institutions, especially private madrasas, can proceed as expected and meet the goals of the education community.

It is interesting and important that the researcher chose private madrasas over public madrasas and general schools because even though madrasas are associated with schools, private madrasas have more specific and distinct issues regarding educational quality, governance, and low interest in schooling, as well as inadequate physical facilities. Why is the Education Council the main subject of discussion in this study? Besides recognizing its crucial role, there has also been a vacuum in this institution while educational issues have emerged in the Bekasi Regency. There are many reasons why the Education Council is an interesting and important topic of study in this research. This is because the Education Council has specific objectives, tasks, and functions, as well as roles and responsibilities in advancing the field of education. The purpose of establishing this institution is, first, to accommodate and channel the aspirations and initiatives of the community in formulating educational policies and programs. Second, to enhance the responsibility and active participation of all layers of society in educational implementation.

Considering its important role, which includes advisory, supportive, control, and mediation roles, the Education Council can be measured as an indicator according to its tasks. In general, the Education Council's main task is to gather, analyze, and provide recommendations to the Minister, Governor, and Regent/Mayor regarding the complaints, suggestions, criticisms, and aspirations of the community regarding education. The question arises, why should the Education Council be formed? Even though there is already the Ministry of Education and Culture responsible for managing and organizing education. The country also has Education Offices from the provincial to the district/city levels, and there are also Technical Implementing Units (UPTDs) at the sub-district level. Normatively, Sunandi, as cited in the Banyuwangi.nu.or.id journal, explains that this is due to the paradigm shift in the governance of affairs in this country since the enactment of Law Number 22 of 1999 concerning regional governments. Almost all government affairs in this country have been fully delegated to the district/city governments, except for three matters: foreign affairs, finance, and religion. Educational affairs, including those delegated to regional governments, are implemented by the Ministry of Education and Culture, Provincial Education Offices, and District/City Education Offices, involving community components as working partners. Educational units, including school principals, must also establish relationships and partnerships with community components involved in educational institutions such as the Education Council and School/Madrasah Committees. The purpose of this law is to provide broad, real, and responsible authority to regions and communities, allowing regions and communities the freedom to regulate and implement their own authority according to local interests and the potential of each region.

The functions and duties of the Education Council have become the focus of research, especially in terms of its role and supervision. As in other areas, the demand for the establishment of an Education Council is not only based on legal demands but also on fundamental reasons why the Education Council is important to be immediately established in Bekasi Regency, due to educational problems arising in the community regarding educational service quality, learning processes, as well as school facilities and infrastructure, school environment situations and conditions. There are several educational problems in Bekasi Regency, including inadequate facilities and educators. This is because there is often sectoral ego in each Regional Apparatus Organization (OPD) in carrying out its functions. There should be cooperation among planning, health, development, personnel, and financial management fields for the progress of education.

The Bekasi Regency government continues to strive to improve the quality of education. However, various existing programs have not been able to solve educational problems. This is evidenced by the many unusable school buildings, dropouts, and teacher issues. Member of the West Java Provincial DPRD, Faisal Hafan Farid, considers the presence of the Education Council in Bekasi Regency very important. He is confident that if the Education Council is filled with competent individuals, educational problems in Bekasi Regency can be well addressed, such as damaged schools, improving the quality of human resources for both teachers and students, inputting local curricula, and others.

With the emergence of many problems mentioned above, many questions arise for the community regarding the effectiveness of supervision conducted by relevant institutions and agencies, including the Bekasi Regency Government through the Education Office, and the legislative body of the Regional People's Representative Council, as well as social control by the community, and the supervision of other institutions such as the Bekasi Regency Education Council (which has been vacant for 12 years) and was re-established in 2022. Added to this is the weak supervision of the Bekasi Regency Education Office, including the stagnant allocation of education funds such as the School Operational Assistance (BOS) funds (stalled BOS fund management) (https://ruangberitakita.com). Anomalies were found causing the BOS budget allocation not to be optimally utilized; this condition was due to the lack of vigilance by the Head of the Education Office in overseeing and controlling the deposit of Giro fees into the BOS fund account, resulting in the BOS fund account balance not reflecting the actual value and leading to suboptimal utilization of BOS funds.

The community perceives the functions and responsibilities of stakeholders, including the Regency Government, Regional People's Representative Council, and Education Office, as weak, evident from the lack of coordination among these institutions resulting in the chaos in the education sector in Bekasi Regency, particularly regarding school facilities and infrastructure, educational services, curriculum, and the emergence of moral decay and low moral ethics in some cases involving students, such as sexual harassment. Many educational problems are attributed to various parties, including teachers, parents/guardians, Regional/Central Governments, Education Offices, and other institutions, including the Education Council. As education observer Sunawan Al Garuti mentioned (Inijabar.com, 2019), he urged the Education Office (Disdik) to have a well-prepared plan and promptly establish the Education Council to accommodate and channel the aspirations and initiatives of the community in formulating educational policies and programs in Bekasi Regency, West Role Model Of The Education Council On The Performance Of Madrasah Principals And Madrasah Teachers (Private) In Bekasi District

Java. The hope is that with the establishment of the Education Council, there will no longer be reports of damaged schools, collapsed schools, or schools lacking furniture.

The reality on the ground is that the aforementioned issues persist and occur, thus they must be promptly addressed by stakeholders, starting from the Education Office, Bekasi Regency Government, together with other educational communities. This indicates the lack of educational supervision by relevant institutions such as the Education Office, Ministry of Religious Affairs (Kemenag), Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD), and weak community control. It is noted that 60% of madrasas in Bekasi Regency are not accredited. According to the Head of the Ministry of Religious Affairs Office in Bekasi Regency, 155 out of 258 madrasas are not accredited due to financial issues in building infrastructure. Private madrasas are also unable to be mandated to use the independent curriculum as implemented by public madrasas due to reasons such as readiness, facilities and infrastructure, understanding, and the need for adjustments for private madrasas.

The recently formed Education Council, does it have a role, impact, and tangible benefits from overseeing its implementation, both for the institution itself and the educational community and other stakeholders such as the Education Office, Ministry of Religious Affairs, DPRD, and the Local Government. Conversely, what are the complaints that arise if the supervision of the Bekasi Regency Education Council's implementation is ineffective? This research aims to examine and delve deeper into the model role of the Bekasi Regency Education Council on the performance of private madrasah principals and teachers in the Bekasi Regency, providing references and recommendations to achieve an improvement in the quality of educational services. The role model of the Education Council refers to laws, ministerial regulations, regional regulations, Regent Decrees, Standard Operational Procedures (SOPs) that are established, and work programs, (in accordance with regulations, where non-compliance is monitored, unlike inspection tasks) thus, mechanisms are made in the form of job descriptions to have a role in supervising educational implementation.

Is the Education Council's oversight in line with expectations, or is there still a gap between expectations and reality? This could occur because it does not adhere to the basic principles of educational provision, does not comply with regulations on educational provision established by the state, or perhaps has not yet adapted to the needs of students as well as advancements in science and technology. This is what the Education Council will supervise, thus, the Education Council has a responsibility to conduct studies on educational provision issues based on the gap between basic principles, regulations, and technical operations in educational provision compared to what has been done in reality in the course of educational provision in Bekasi Regency.

In reality, there is no structured job description, no SOPs, work programs are not made, and it has not started with working meetings. Therefore, the gap between tasks that must be carried out technically, regulations, and implementation has not been done correctly. However, many community hopes rest on the solution of the Education Council's role and oversight from all parties, including the Local Government, Education Office, Ministry of Religious Affairs, DPRD, by establishing and reactivating the Education Council as one of the control pillars to address the aforementioned issues.

Based on the background description of this problem, there are still many obstacles or problems faced by the education sector, especially Islamic educational institutions in carrying out their educational service processes such as lack of educational personnel, facilities and infrastructure, teacher welfare, and others. While the supervisory institutions overseeing education such as the Education Office, Ministry of Religious Affairs, DPRD, and Bekasi Regency Government, as well as the Education Council, still lack coordination. Coupled with the lack of active community support and participation in education, the researcher will examine the role model of the Bekasi Regency Education Council on the performance of private madrasah principals and teachers by studying Islamic educational institutions in Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, Madrasah Tsanawiyah, and Madrasah Aliyah.

Research Method

This research method utilizes Mixed Methods, which is a research approach that combines both quantitative and qualitative methods. Researchers need to understand the characteristics of both methods (Sugiyono, 2017). The combination research method is a method that integrates quantitative and qualitative methods to be used together or interchangeably to obtain more comprehensive, valid, reliable, and objective data results (Sugiyono, 2018). Quantitative research focuses more on deductive model hypothesis and theory testing, analysis and prediction of data, data collection, and statistical analysis design. Quantitative research is a systematic investigation of phenomena by collecting measurable data using statistical, mathematical, or computational techniques. Quantitative research is defined by cause and effect. The method used in data collection is by providing questions and questionnaires.

According to (Riduwan & Kuncoro, 2017).the definition of a sample is "a part of the population." A research sample is a portion of the population taken as a source of data and can represent the entire population. If the number of subjects is less than 100, it is better to take all of them, making the research a population study. Furthermore, if the subject is large, between 10%-15% 20%-25%, or more can be taken. Regarding the sampling technique, Nasution (1991:135) states, "The quality of research is not always determined by the size of the sample, but by the solidity of its theoretical foundations, the design of the researcher (statistical assumptions), and the quality of its implementation and processing." According to Sudjana, a lecturer at Unpad Bandung and several famous universities in Jakarta, if the population is heterogeneous, it is better to divide it into several strata or layers. The creation of strata is determined based on certain characteristics so that the strata become homogeneous. From each stratum, members are then randomly selected, or in other words, random sampling is done within each stratum. The combination of members obtained will form a stratum sample.

If members are not randomly selected from each stratum but by other means, quota sampling occurs. Stratum sampling is usually improved by using proportional methods. It is intended that many members of each stratum are taken in proportion to the size of each stratum. This method is called proportional random sampling, and the sample is called a proportional random sample (Sudjana, 2005). Based on the concept presented above, the

researcher selects a proportional random sample of nine from the total number of madrasas in Bekasi Regency because it is not possible to study all madrasas in Bekasi Regency considering the availability of research time and other factors such as research costs. Data on madrasas in Bekasi Regency based on school levels or strata are Elementary Madrasah (MI) totaling 208, Junior High Madrasah (MTs) totaling 127, and Senior High Madrasah (MA) totaling 41. So, the total number of madrasas in Bekasi Regency is 376 madrasas. (https://data.sekolah-kita.net). Therefore, based on the proportional random sampling method, the following formula can be used:

From the total number of madrasas, the researcher randomly selects nine madrasas as a random sample. It is known from the data that there are 208 MIs, 127 MTs, and 41 MAs. There are 3 strata with the ratio of MI: MTs: MA = 208: 127: 41. The total is 376. So, from: In determining the sample size, the researcher uses the formula from Taro Yamane or Slovin as stated in Riduwan (2007: 65) as follows:

$$\frac{N}{ne^2+1}$$

Where:

n = Sample size;

N = Population size;

E2 = Preset precision.

Using the formula above, the sample size to be used is determined by:

$$\frac{N}{nd^2+1}$$

Where:

n = Sample size;

N = 376

D = 10%

So:

$$n = \frac{376}{376(0.1)^2 + 1} = \frac{376}{376(0.01) + 1}$$

$$=\frac{376}{4,76}=78,99$$

= 79 respondents are selected.

Thus, from a population of 376, a sample of 79 individuals is obtained. The sample members selected by the researcher from madrasahs in Kabupaten Bekasi are as follows:

 $=\frac{208}{376}$ X 9 Madrasah = 4.98 rounded up to 5 MI Stratum selected

 $=\frac{127}{376}$ X 9 Madrasah = 3,03 rounded up to 3 MTs Stratum selected

MA Stratum selected =
$$\frac{41}{376}$$
 X 9 Madrasah = 0,98 rounded up to 1

Based on the calculation above, the random proportional sampling data obtained for investigation are as follows: 5 Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, 3 Madrasah Tsanawiyah, and 1 Madrasah Aliyah. The sampling technique utilized is a method where every member of the population has an equal chance of being selected as a sample member.

Result and Discussion

Quantitative Results of the Role of the Education Council as a Controller

Based on field findings, it was observed that the Education Council, as a controller, according to members of the IV Commission of the Bekasi District DPRD, lacks synergy with the DPRD regarding supervision or the results of performance or programs that have been implemented, such as policy evaluation, program evaluation, and educational outcomes. This can be seen from the graduation rates in Bekasi District, and the results of teacher competency tests in Bekasi District are far below standard. Based on the explanation from the chairperson of the Education Council, there was no work plan for the Education Council from the beginning; we only intervened if there were urgent issues. Therefore, the role of the Education Council as a controller has not been optimal up to this point.

The role of the Education Council as a controller can be further developed so that its presence will create a transparent and accountable situation between the madrasah and the community in the implementation and utilization of education financing. Policies and the results of efforts made by the Education Council to improve the quality of education, especially in assisting education financing in those schools, should not solely be entrusted to education managers. However, the implementation of policies and the use of financing should not be exempt from the control of the Education Council, including evaluating and supervising policies, programs, implementation, and educational outcomes in madrasahs. However, the Education Council has not yet conducted evaluations on policies, programs, implementation, and educational outcomes at schools.

Qualitative Analysis

The relationship between the role of the Education Council and stakeholders can be seen in the following table:

Table 3
Stakeholder Assessment Indicators of the Role of the Education Council in Bekasi District

No	Stakeholder	Role of The Education Council
1	Dewan Pendidikan	The role not yet implemented
2	Department of Education	Still, in the realm of expectations, its role
		has not been applied

Role Model Of The Education Council On The Performance Of Madrasah Principals And Madrasah Teachers (Private) In Bekasi District

3	Ministry of Religious Affairs	Insufficient socialization of the role of the
	(Kemenag) of Bekasi Regency	Education Council in madrasahs
4	Regional Representative Council	No significant role yet
	(DPRD) of Bekasi Regency	

The purpose of establishing institutions such as the Education Council is to improve the quality of education services as mandated by the law. Direct observations conducted by the researcher regarding the quality of education services associated with the role of the Education Council from the determined sample were obtained qualitatively, indicating that the benefits of this institution for madrasahs as Islamic educational institutions are not felt. Here are the research findings based on the existing indicators for madrasahs at the level of Madrasah Ibtidaiyah, Madrasah Tsanawiyah, and Madrasah Aliyah.

> Table 4 Research Findings on the Role of the Education Council in Education Quality

Research Findings on the Role of the Education Council in Education Quality			
Islamic Education	Qualitative	Indicators	Observation
Institutions	Role		Results
			Not applicable
	Support	Monitoring the educational workforce conditions in schools Mobilizing non-teaching educational	Not applicable
	Agency	staff to address deficiencies	Not applicable
		Coordinating support for facilities	
		and infrastructure from the community	Not applicable
		Monitoring the education budget	
		conditions in schools	
Primary Islamic			
School (MI)		Identifying community aspirations	
		in the field of education	
Junior High Islamic		Providing recommendations on	Not applicable
School (MTs)		decisions of the Department of	• •
	Advice	Education	Not applicable
Senior High Islamic	Agency	Providing considerations regarding	Not applicable
School (MA)		local content to the Department of	Not applicable
		Education	riot applicable
		Providing considerations on the	
		rotation of teacher and school principal	
-		staff	
	Mediator	Acting as a liaison between the	Not applicable
	Agency	Department of Education and the	Not applicable
	-	Regional Representative Council	• •
		(DPRD)	Not applicable
		Acting as a liaison between the Department of Education and schools	Not applicable

Islamic Education Institutions	Qualitative Role	Indicators	Observation Results
		Communicating community	
	complaints and grievances to relevant		
	institutions in the field of education		
		Coordinating community assistance.	

If we look at the relationship between the Education Council and stakeholders, as well as Islamic educational institutions, we can see its role in the following table:

Table 5 Relationship of the Education Council's Role with Madrasahs and Stakeholders

Role of The Education Council	Stakeholder & Madrasah	Qualitative Role
	Department of Education	
Support	Ministry of Religious Affairs	Madwacah Orrawall their releasers not
Advice	of the District	Madrasah Overall, their roles are not
Mediacy	District Legislative Council	optimally fulfilled.
	Madrasah	

Conclusion

Quantitative research indicates that there is a role of the Education Council on the performance of the Head of Madrasah and Madrasah Teachers, but qualitatively, the research findings suggest that there is no role of the Education Council on the performance of the Head of Madrasah and Madrasah Teachers. The supervisory role carried out by the Education Council is crucial both quantitatively and qualitatively on the performance of the Head of Madrasah and Madrasah Teachers because Islamic educational institutions have been largely neglected until now.

Coordination and synchronization, not only with the Department of Education but also with the Ministry of Religious Affairs (Kemenag) of the District overseeing the madrasah, are essential for data gathering. However, the Education Council has not conducted supervision in madrasahs due to a lack of coordination.

Improvements and innovations in the concept of Education Council supervision should involve systematic, practical, simple, and strategic reporting using a single application. For instance, an application named the Education Council App or AppDP, or any other term that is easily recognizable and practical, could contain concise yet comprehensive reporting of the Education Council's functions, duties, and roles

Bibliography

Arisujati, Arisujati. (n.d.). Dewan Pendidikan. Https://Www.Academia.Edu/10927420/DEWAN_PENDIDIKAN.

Bisri, A. M. (2020). Studi Analisis Komite Sekolah/Madrasah Dalam Mengawal Kualitas Pendidikan. Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam, 1(1), 51-64.

- Hartono, Hartono. (2015). Otonomi Pendidikan. Potensia: Jurnal Kependidikan Islam, 1(1), 51-
- Herawati, E. S. B., Suryadi, S., Warlizasusi, J., & Aliyyah, R. R. (2020). Kinerja Dewan Pendidikan Dalam Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan. Tadbir: Jurnal Studi Manajemen Pendidikan, 4(1), 87-100.
- Jamaludin, Agus. (2018). Berita dan Inovasi Pemerintah Kabupaten Tangerang. Https://Tangerangkab.Go.Id.
- Nefina, D., Rahman, L. Z., & Sari, N. K. (2021). Peran Dewan Pendidikan terhadap Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Pendidikan Islam. Intelektual: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Studi Keislaman, 11(3), 222-237.
- Riduwan, Riduwan, & Kuncoro, Engkos Achmad. (2017). Cara Menggunakan dan Memakai Path Analysis (Analisis Jalur). Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Rosyidah, A. (2019). Peranan Dinas Pendidikan dalam peningkatan kualitas pendidikan madrasah, madrasah diniyah, dan pesantren di Kabupaten Pasuruan Jawa Timur. UIN Sunan Ampel.
- Sahara Siregar, Gusma Gabe. (2020). Pengaruh kepemimpinan kepala sekolah, peran komite sekolah dan kinerja guru terhadap efektivitas manajemen berbasis sekolah di MAN Kota Medan. EduTech: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Sosial, 6(2), 379022.
- Sudjana, Sudjana. (2005). Metode Statistika (Enam). Bandung: Tarsito.
- Sugiyono. (2017). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2018). Metode penelitian pendidikan pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif, dan R&D.